

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Centre for
Accreditation and Quality Assurance
in Education and Healthcare
December 21, 2023

**REPORT
OF AN EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM EVALUATION
“OPHTHALMOLOGY FOR ADULTS, CHILDREN” OF THE CORPORATE
FUND “UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER”
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES)
OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: November 27-29, 2022.

Astana, 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty - Ophthalmology for adults, children.	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”	
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”	
5.	Recommendations for improving the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”	
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council on the accreditation of an educational residency program in the specialty “A Ophthalmology for adults, children”	
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of residency in the specialty of the educational program “Ophthalmology for adults, children”	
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
CF "UMC"	Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre"
EEC	External expert commission
ECAQA	Eurasian Accreditation Center
RDC	Republican Diagnostic Center

ECAQA

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 26 dated November 8, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the residency educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" during the period November 27-29, 2023, with the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-rector for scientific and clinical work of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NGO "Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region", member of the International Society of Surgeons (International Surgery Society), member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and the "Union of Independent Experts of KSMU".
2	Foreign expert	Ziganshina Liliya Yevgenevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Epidemiology of the Russian Medical Academy of Continuing Professional Education, Director of Cochrane Russia. Member of the WHO Committee on the Selection and Use of Essential Medicines. Laureate of the State Prize of the Republic of Tatarstan in the field of science and technology for the work "Development and implementation in healthcare practice of the Republic of Tatarstan of a new technology for the selection and rational use of drugs - the formulary system."
3	Foreign expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Cardio Rheumatology of the Institution "National Research Centre for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic (MHKR), Chief Rheumatologist of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice-President of the Association of Rheumatologists of Central Asia and Kazakhstan
4	Academic expert	Zhantelieva Lyazzat Asanovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Research JSC "Scientific Center of Urology named after. B.U.Dzharbusynov"
5	Academic expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anaesthesiology and resuscitation National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
6	Academic expert	Idrisov Alisher Saugabaevich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Family Medicine No. 2

			NJSC "Astana Medical University"
7	Academic expert	Menchisheva Yulia Alexandrovna	Doctor PhD, Head of the Department of Surgical Dentistry of NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov"
8	Academic expert	Ramzanova Sholpan Khamzaevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Childhood Diseases named after N.A. Barlybaeva NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
9	Academic expert	Dolmatova Irina Anatolyevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, acting Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
10	Academic expert	Arinova Saule Pasevnoevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Karaganda Medical University"
11	Academic expert	Karibaeva Dina Orynbasarovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department Fundamental Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi
12	Academic expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, assistant Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine named after Professor Pruglo Yu.V. NJSC "Semey Medical University"
13	Resident expert	Orynbay Aizere Sauletkyzy	resident of the second year of study in the specialty "General Surgery" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"
14	Resident expert	Yerkinov Yerbolat	resident of the first year of study in the specialty "Angiosurgery, including children's" LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre". Resident of the surgical community "Veritas" NJSC "Astana Medical University"

The EEC report includes a description of the results and conclusion of an external evaluation of the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational institutions and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational program and accreditation recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children"

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre"
Management Body	Board of the CF "UMC"

Full name of the first manager	Pya Yuri Vladimirovich Chairman of the Board, Doctor of Medical Sciences
Date of creation	20.09.2015
Location and contact details	RK, 010000, “Yesil” district, Astana, st. Kerey, Zhanibek khandar, 51. Email: umc@umc.org.kz
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	Residency training at the CF “UMC” is carried out in accordance with Article 8 of the Law on the status of “Nazarbayev University”, “Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools”, “Nazarbayev Foundation”. Their organizations carry out educational activities without a license, without state certification. The residency program is implemented in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process at the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	2023
Duration of training	3 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	There was no release
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	5
Full-time teachers/part-time teachers involved in the implementation of the EP	The total number of teachers is 7, including full-time teachers - 7, part-time teachers - ____. Sedateness,% - 28.9 Categorization, % - 71.1
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	Website: www.umc.org.kz

The educational program “Ophthalmology for adults and children” has been implemented since September 2023. The educational program includes 6 disciplines: outpatient ophthalmology 1.2; ophthalmology in hospital 1,2,3; microsurgery, 4 optional components. There are currently 5 people studying in the residency. Teachers - 7 people, 1 of them has a candidate of medical sciences degree, 1 has a master's degree. 5 people have the highest qualification category. Residents are expected to approve topics on current issues in ophthalmology. Topics for presentations by residents at the “Journal club” are being prepared.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

To date, accreditation of the educational program of the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” has not been carried out.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”

The report on the self-assessment of the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 145 pages of main text, 45-page annexes, copies or electronic versions of documents located at the link www.umc.org.kz.

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of

the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Rector, Deputy Chairman of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" N. Khamzina, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 9 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program - Director of the Department of Education, Chairman of the working group Syzdykova A.A.

Self-assessment of the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Chairman of the Board of the CF "UMC" No. 08 n/k dated 06/01/2023 "On approval of the composition of preparation for specialized accreditation of the CF "UMC".

All standards contain the actual practice of the CF "UMC" in training residents in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2023, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of evaluation of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the CF "UMC" and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is presented to ECAQA in complete form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain links in the text and are continuously numbered.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA. Dates of the visit to the organization: November 27-29, 2023. The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 15 people;
- interviews with residents – 73 people, including foreign ones;
- studying the website www.umc.org.kz;
- interviewing 39 employees, 29 teachers, 10 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents – 39 and 49, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending 1 practical training (Examination methods of U.A. Apukhtin, Department of Ophthalmology, RCD)
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: 2 practice/clinical training bases were visited, including the Republican Diagnostic Centre (Ophthalmology Department), Day Hospital, where training is provided in 1 educational program with the participation of 7 full-time teachers/part-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 6 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC

№	Position	Quantity
1	Teachers in surgical specialties	17
2	Teachers in the following specialties: "Medical Genetics, Pathological Anatomy. Radiology"	6
3	Teachers in paediatric and therapeutic specialties	16
4	1st year residents	55
5	2nd year residents	18
6	3rd year residents	3

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion was held on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, talks, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed and Chairman E.M. Turgunov held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the University, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

When conducting a survey of residents, 75% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 25% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (80%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.

According to 85% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children"

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

The mission of the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children" is implemented on the basis of the mission of "UMC", aimed at improving the medical care provided by training a highly qualified specialist ophthalmologist who has theoretical and practical knowledge and skills, is able to successfully solve professional problems, and is able to carry out differential diagnostic search, provide full ophthalmological care; carry out all necessary rehabilitation measures for patients with ophthalmological pathology.

When implementing program activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body of the Board of Trustees of the Autonomous Educational Organization "Nazarbayev University", in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programs, took part in the formation of

proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations.

The experts got acquainted with the organization's strategic plan for the period 2019-2023, which includes such areas as educational, research and clinical activities, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

During the visit to the departments of the educational organization, experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational program, including: the educational organization has departments that are directly related to the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the combination of educational, clinical, and research activities of residents.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program are aimed at improving the medical care provided by training a qualified ophthalmologist, and the educational process is structured in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, during meetings with residents, experts identified a number of problems, including in relation to the research activities of residents.

The educational organization conducts training for residents in the following clinical sites and departments: RDC, where a patient-oriented approach is provided through the issuance of a privilege sheet signed by the resident doctor, curator, department head and Centre head. The educational organization pays due attention to the safety and autonomy of patients by signing an informed consent for non-disclosure of confidential information about patients by the resident doctor.

Experts have established that residents have appropriate working conditions to support their own health, since the educational organization has ensured the organization of workplaces in the departments, maintaining the health of patients, through reinforcement to the Family Health Centre of the RDC, and the provision of personal protective equipment by the organization; providing adequate nutrition.

Such basic competencies of residents in an accredited specialty, such as medical knowledge, skills, professionalism, as well as special competencies that include practical skills of students while maintaining patient safety, help educational organizations apply innovative forms of training. This will allow residents to develop such skills and qualities as the research competencies of residents of the CF "UMC".

The educational organization encourages residents to strive to participate in research in their chosen specialty through access to foreign databases of scientific and educational literature: Elsevier, Web of Knowledge, Clarivate Analytics, etc., and also ensures the participation of residents in such academic events that are approved Regulations on scientific and innovative activities 02/22/2018 CF "UMC" No. 4. Resident doctors participate in scientific projects, conferences; prepare publications, independently or jointly with doctors. The decision of the EMC approved the "Requirements for the content, design and defence of research work under the residency program."

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts have determined that the formation of professionalism includes the implementation of a competent model of medical education, focused on the final result of training. In the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" the final learning outcomes are: patient supervision, communication and collaboration; safety and quality, public health, research, training and development. The key competency of graduates of the CF "UMC" residency is professionalism: the resident's ability to demonstrate ethical behaviour, compassion, responsiveness beyond self-interest, respect for others, acceptance and recognition of personal mistakes. The organization of education promotes the professional autonomy of residents by providing them with independent determination of the content of the elective component disciplines, as well as additional types of training, which is

discussed at meetings of the Educational and Methodological Council of the CF “UMC”. The individual educational trajectory of the student is determined by individual work plans,

Experts have established that the educational organization fully exercises autonomy in relation to the selection of residents for the accredited specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”, development of an educational program, determination of approaches to the evaluation of residents (formative, summative evaluation), as it is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC”, approved by the decision of the Board of the CF “UMC” dated 03/29/2021 No. 6. The rules for admission to the residency of the CF “UMC”, approved by the Board of the CF “UMC” dated 03/01/2018 No. 5. Responsible employees showed the experts a document defining the requirements for teachers of the residency program. The employment of residents is regulated by healthcare requirements and the indicator is 100% (using the example of other specialties).

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the organization Pya Yu.V. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: what is the purpose of the activities of CF "UMC". During the answers, the director of the organization confirmed that the goal is to provide effective, high-quality medical care to the population, development, implementation, dissemination of modern technologies in science, education.

The academic freedom of residents is manifested in the corresponding freedom of expression, requests, publications and is ensured by the educational organization through mechanisms such as motivation for publications, speeches at conferences, participation in various educational events at the CF “UMC” and in other organizations and is described in the document Rules for the organization of educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC” dated 03/01/2018 No. 6.

When conducting a survey of 59 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It was found that 89% of residents would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 26% of respondents believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students’ problems related to learning. To the question “Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?”, 89% of residents answered positively, 9% were not sure about this, 2% could not yet answer this question and 0% would like to believe it.

The 39 teachers surveyed (21 survey questions) also answered that 87% were satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization, and 13% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees and responds promptly to requests and requests. In the questionnaire, 83% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 10% are partially satisfied. In the opinion of 100% of the educational organization, the teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The final learning outcomes are defined and included in the educational document “Ophthalmology for adults, children” which was developed by the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC” and approved by the Educational and Methodological Council dated April 27, 2023, Protocol No. 15. Informing interested parties about the final results of training of residents in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” is carried out by posting on the official website of the CF “UMC”. The criteria for assessing the level of competencies are reflected in the syllabuses, which are also posted on the website. The experts were convinced that the professional behaviour and communication skills of residents are formed through the Code of Ethics and are reflected in the corresponding document - the Code of Business Ethics was approved by the decision of the Board of the CF “UMC”. No. 17 dated December 26, 2022 Faculty and residents are informed about the code of ethics. You can familiarize yourself with the contents of the code of ethics on the official website of the CF “UMC”.

When determining the final learning outcomes, employees of the Department of Education took into account previous learning outcomes in undergraduate and internship programs, and also took into account the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty. The educational organization provides training in additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development), including programs in the specialty of an accredited educational program. For example, programs have been developed and implemented on the following topics: are under development.

The surveyed teachers responded that 85% were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 15% were partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed 8 additional education programs, including for the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults and children." Residents are informed about this.

91% of teacher respondents believe that students in this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 9% partially agree with this.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results

When developing the goals and objectives of the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children", the Department of Science and Education, employees of the ophthalmology department of the RCD took part, which is confirmed by the EMC document No. 5 dated April 27, 2023, and the mission of the CF "UMC" is reflected in the strategic plan of the CF "UMC", approved on May 25, 2019. Suggestions were made such as the need to combine research, educational and clinical activities. When updated regulations and orders in education and healthcare are issued, the developers of the educational program take into account that the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children" was developed on the basis of the standard program of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, taking into account international practice, and make appropriate changes. For example, the order in the development of the strategy and mission took part in the structural divisions of the CF "UMC", discussions also took place at meetings of the advisory bodies; so the Educational and Methodological Council dated 05/08/2019. No. 3, prompted teachers to add the following to the training program: a combination of research, educational, and clinical activities.

At the same time, when talking with residents and employers, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?", "What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?" To these questions, residents answered that the educational program is posted on the CF "UMC" website, where you can familiarize yourself with it, and employers responded as follows:

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully – 14.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The model of the educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" is determined on the basis of the final learning outcomes of residents, therefore it includes the following: sections: outpatient ophthalmology-1,2; ophthalmology in hospital - 1,2,3; optional component (4); microsurgery. Disciplines of evidence-based medicine, research management. Duration of training is 3 years. Systematic and transparent training is guaranteed by the fact that the educational program "Ophthalmology for adults, children" is carried out in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 "On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process of credit technology of education" and is posted on the website of the CF "UMC".

To implement the educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”, the organization’s documents contain educational guidelines, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established, including the academic load of one year of study is 70 academic credits. The volume of classroom work is 10%, clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor is 75%, independent work of the student is 15%, and theoretical training is 20% of the volume of the curriculum.

By attending a practical lesson (or seminar/master class) on the topic: Research methods in ophthalmology (Ophthalmology in a hospital-1), volume of hours - 4, the experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher and have the opportunity to improve their skills in the methods of primary examination of a patient with ophthalmic pathology. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since experts have studied the code of ethics (Code of Business Ethics dated December 26, 2022 No. 17.) and during the interview, residents responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system, which is described in the document Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC”, 04/20/2021 No. 6, was evaluated. There are a total of 7 mentors, whose tasks are to develop proposals to improve the quality and effectiveness of residency programs; provide resident doctors with patients in the department; providing leadership to clinical practice; conducting joint rounds, discussing the examination and treatment plan; monitoring attendance and progress: participation in educational events; compilation of characteristics based on the results of completion of residency; control of the appearance of the resident doctor.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Guidebook, 2023, Astana and on the website <http://umc.org.kz/about/science/rezidentura>.

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” corresponds to level 8 of the national qualification framework (ESG1.2) and has code 140008.

Teachers use such methods of teaching residents as theoretical teaching methods; interactive methods of theoretical teaching: group discussion, portfolio, presentations, simulation technologies; modelling of real professional activities; clinical training: patient management, participation in clinical discussions of complex cases, in surgical interventions, preparation of reports on the activities of departments, practicing practical skills in the simulation Centre. The list of teaching methods is described in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC" dated 03/01/2021. Thanks to this method, residents can take part in the provision of medical care to patients. Teachers can provide a resident with supervision of 5 patients (Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC”) per day and 100 per month. For example, residents of an educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” upon completion of training can perform such manipulations as examining patients with a slit lamp, direct and reverse ophthalmoscopy, perimetry, tonometry, refractometry, parabolbar, subconjunctival, retrobulbar injections.

Experts have found that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in educational organizations. This is reflected in the document Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC". Academic integrity applies to phases of resident training such as clinical practice. And anti-plagiarism is applicable when residents are engaged in research activities. Residents are trained to promptly collect informed consent from patients for any diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. The experts noted that the medical records contain a corresponding document signed by the patient.

Thus, by the end of the 3-year training, residents will acquire basic skills in the profession of ophthalmology, which will allow them to work in institutions such as health care institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Nazarbayev University, and RDC (ESG 1.2).

The experts did not establish any violations with respect to the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, since the educational organization complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other regulatory legal acts in the field of education and healthcare. For example, an educational organization employs 167 people, of which 67% are women and 33% are men.

In the educational organization, there is a mechanism for regularly adapting teaching and learning methods to the requirements of modern science and education, as well as to the current needs of practical healthcare. This mechanism includes maintaining communication between the CF "UMC" and practical healthcare organizations. Employees of the CF "UMC" take part in boards, conferences, meetings in the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and hold an "Open Day".

This demonstrates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of tailoring training to the needs of residents. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the document Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", the organization does not have an anti-plagiarism system.

2.2 Scientific method

The educational program includes the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research (discipline "Ophthalmology for adults, children", topic "Use of the drug "Tepezza" in the treatment of endocrine ophthalmopathy" number of hours 54), including clinical research and clinical epidemiology (number of hours 54). When talking with residents, experts learned that they use scientific evidence in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of a "Journal club", which is held once a month.

When surveying residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to students' participation in research work and 70% of people are completely satisfied with this, 20% are partially satisfied, and 10% are dissatisfied. Residents should engage in research and in response to the questionnaire, 30% wrote that they are already engaged in research, 20% are planning to start, 15% are looking for a research topic, 10% are not engaged.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including "Ophthalmology for adults and children." The Department of Science and Education is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including ophthalmologists, as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers. These include lectures, seminars, articles, and reports at conferences. For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" the organization has the resources to organize an assessment of the practical skills of residents (use the RDC equipment, software, simulation and computer classes). However, there are difficulties in planning, developing and approving educational programs, including elective components. Experts have established that the educational program takes into account the requirements of legislation, including those regarding the provision of specialized ophthalmological care to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The theoretical component of the educational program is 9 hours, including 10% of study time, 9 disciplines/topics. The practical component of the educational program consists of personally providing patient care and responsibility for providing care, as reflected on each resident's privilege

sheet. Possible future roles of a residency graduate, namely, a medical expert, a manager, are formed through such disciplines (or topics) as outpatient ophthalmology, inpatient ophthalmology 1,2,3. The legal aspects of a doctor's activities are discussed during discipline classes at meetings of the Grand Round (educational and clinical commission). The scientific component in resident training is formed through a journal club.

The organization of education ensures that the structure, content and duration of the educational program are adjusted in the event of any changes in different sciences, demographics, as well as in response to the needs of the health care system. There is a feedback mechanism for this.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 90% are completely satisfied, 10% are partially satisfied, 0% are not satisfied.

The organization has its own clinical base with 457 beds and 800 outpatient visits, and has also entered into 6 agreements with medical organizations, including 1 with foreign ones (Pittsburgh). And to the survey question "Is there sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)", 80% of residents responded with complete agreement, 15% partially agreed, 5% disagreed. At the same time, 100% of residents claim that after completing classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

At the same time, to the question "Do resident representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", the experts received the following answer: "Resident doctors receive information about the educational program on the CF "UMC" website."

The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (90%).

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the department by the Department of Education and conversations with the head and employees. At the same time, verification of **standard 2** showed that there is a relationship between the provision of medical care and postgraduate education.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the Department of Surgery; a total of 4 meetings were held and during a cross-interview it was established that the CF "UMC" unites three innovative healthcare facilities located in Astana.

Thus, responsibility for choosing the basis for clinical training and practice of a resident in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" rests with the Department of Science and Education. Experts analysed information about the availability of accreditation of clinical sites and concluded that students have the opportunity to undergo training in departments of various profiles in accordance with the educational program.

The training of residents in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults and children" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analysing the shortage of specialists for 2022__, it was found that the provision of the population with ophthalmologists is less than 0.4 per 10,000 residents of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Therefore, this organization is specialized in the provision of specialized ophthalmological care to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in ophthalmology. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information about in which medical institutions ophthalmology residents are trained, and teachers confirmed that residents are trained directly in the clinical departments of the Republican Diagnostic Center. Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with diseases such as inflammatory diseases of the eyelids, conjunctiva, and cornea; as well as vascular lesions of the retina and optic nerve.

This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization.

When attending a practical lesson (or lecture/seminar/master class) on the topic Methods of diagnosing patients with ophthalmopathology, lasting 4 hours and talking with residents, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including

using simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

Integration between training and clinical care (on-the-job training) is achieved by ensuring that the resident is a member of the clinical team and has the authority to provide clinical care to patients according to their specialty. Training is conducted in accordance with clinical protocols.

Of the 79 residents surveyed, 91% responded that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 9% believed that they rarely or sometimes.

The following employees took part in the planning, discussion, approval and review of the educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults and children”: Apukhlina U.A., Semenova Yu.M., Yerkimbekova T.A.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliance out of 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -21, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To include in the educational program such topics as neoplasms of the organ of vision, vascular diseases of the orbit, and parasitic pathologies of the orbit.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment methods

The study of control and measurement tools (100 tests, 50 tasks, oral questioning) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During interviews, residents talked about assessment forms, for example, formative, summative, a list of practical skills, and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing assessment results is reflected in the document Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC” dated 03.29.2021 No. 6 and during the period of operation of the educational organization there were no precedents for appeal. The assessment covers not only knowledge and skills, but also professional behaviour and communication skills, which is confirmed by the following: Instructions for the development of educational and methodological documentation and a system for assessing the knowledge of educational achievements of resident doctors of the CF “UMC” (approved by the decision of the Department of Medical Education No. 2 of May 13, 2021) in subparagraph 20, “evaluation of resident doctors” is based on the principles of academic integrity, which is the main principle of the learning process.”

The criteria for admission to the final certification are:

1. resident’s portfolio;
2. attendance log
3. statements on the discipline, reflecting basic, midterm control, intermediate certification. This is documented in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC”, approved by decision of the Board of the CF “UMC” dated March 29, 2021 No. 6.

The admission for independent examination of residents is the admission of resident doctors to the Final Certification by order of the supervising head of the CF “UMC” on the list two weeks before the certification. In the practice of educational organizations, residents (including other specialties) pass an independent examination in 100% of cases.

Validation and assessment of the reliability of resident assessment methods (tests, tasks, cases) is carried out as follows: Accounting and monitoring of assessment forms is carried out by the Department of Education together with the science and education sector of the CF “UMC” during the entire training.

In educational organizations, there is a practice of involving external examiners in assessing residents, which is documented in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC”. This ensures the independence and objectivity of the assessment results.

So, to verify the data of standard 3, the experts asked questions to the head of the department A.A. Syzdykova and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents.

The organization has journals, examination sheets on paper, which are stored in the department responsible for residency in the amount of 930, which are compiled in accordance with paragraph 99 of the Rules of the educational process in residency of the CF “UMC” dated 02.15.2018 No. 3 and approved at the meeting of the UMS (Minutes No. 6 dated July 20, 2018). Testing tools are reviewed by the Department of Education. The head of the education department responded that additions and updates to the control and measurement tools are planned to be made in 2024.

The results of resident assessments are documented as follows: assessments are recorded on paper examination sheets.

At the same time, according to the results of the final exam in 2023, 22 people received 22 “excellent”, 15 “good”, 2 “satisfactory”.

There is a document on appealing the assessment results - which is described in the Rules for admission to the residency program of the CF “UMC”, approved by the decision of the Board of the CF “UMC” on 03/01/2018 No 5, which was approved in 2018. To date, there have been no appeals from residents.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with employee A.A. Syzdykova, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operational plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents, the working curriculum “Ophthalmology for adults, children ” working curriculum of the 1st training residency, 9 syllabuses, a log of attendance, progress, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for residents and there is current information that is regularly updated.

During the visit to the organization, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?” The answer was: “Yes.”.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

When conducting interviews with 39 teachers regarding assessment methods, experts received convincing evidence that assessment methods and practices are compatible with learning outcomes and methods, promote integrated learning, provide interdisciplinary learning, promote learning, its adequacy and are consistent with learning. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, counselling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness.

The experts examined resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, and forms of knowledge assessment.

Experts determined that the choice of methods for assessing residents is based on continuous monitoring of the learning process, consolidation of acquired skills, and regular assessment of the achievement of final learning outcomes, since the practical part of training is the main one. For example, ongoing assessment methods such as formative evaluation support inter-professional learning. A method such as summative assessment demonstrates the integration of learning and an emphasis on clinical skills. Established assessment methods ensure that the resident has mastered all sections of the educational program and acquired the necessary practical skills.

Feedback from residents based on the results of their assessment is collected in the form of an assessment and published on the website of the CF “UMC”. In interviews, residents confirmed that they receive feedback after completing their training.

The interviewed representatives of employers also indicated that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since 238 resident doctors were graduated during the period 2016-2023. Employers said that they themselves participate in resident assessments since they were included in 2018. But the educational organization did not

provide systematic feedback to them. Employers believe that residency graduates have such skills as patient supervision, communication and collaboration, as well as the safety and quality of medical care provided and knowledge of the formulation of adequate research problems, the ability to evaluate professional literature, they wanted to see the most powerful.

At the same time, there are difficulties in developing control and measurement tools, including tests.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully – 8, partially – 1, do not comply – 0.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) When compiling tests, take into account the ratio of levels: memorization 10%, understanding 45%, application 45%.
- 2) To translate assessment forms into electronic media.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admissions policy and selection

The educational organization has a policy for the admission of residents, which is called the Rules for admission to the residency program of the CF “UMC”, approved by the decision of the Board of the CF “UMC” dated 03/01/2018 No. 5. Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, the mission of the CF “UMC” is associated with becoming an academic medical Centre providing a high level of medical care, taking into account the combination of research, educational and clinical activities. Transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to residency programs is achieved through the website of the CF “UMC”, which is confirmed in paragraph 20 of the document “Rules for admission to the residency of the CF “UMC” dated 03/01/2018 No. 5”.

The document reflects approaches to accepting residents with disabilities, for example, in paragraph 28.

The document takes into account the requirements for residency applicants in terms of their previous achievements in undergraduate and internship (for example, the final grade for internship should not be less than 3.33 points, the average grade point must be 3.0.), and also describes safety requirements (for example, availability of call buttons).

The educational organization has created a barrier-free learning environment, including the presence of ramps, call buttons, elevators, and toilets for the disabled.

Approaches to the admission and transfer of residents from other educational organizations are reflected in paragraph 10 of the document Rules for Admission to the Residency of the CF “UMC”. In this case, the main points taken into account are the internship score and the average grade point.

The appeal procedure based on the results of admission to residency is prescribed in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC” No. 6 dated 03/01/2018. To date, one appeal has been filed in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” in 2023.

Representatives of students are included in the process of developing a policy for the admission and selection of residents, namely Salimova A., Tsekova A., Shaizat N. Feedback is provided to residents on this issue and the following changes have recently occurred in approaches to the admission of residents: in 2023 The GPA was raised to 3.0 for admission to residency. If applicants have the same scores, their previous experience in conducting research work is taken into account; if they have a certificate of knowledge of the English language, 25 points are added to the results of the entrance exams.

The review of the admission and selection policy and the number of residents is carried out annually, and the Department of Education is responsible for this.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. The experts reviewed the documentation for the admission of residents, including evaluation sheets. Many of the documents are well-written, but there are some issues with paper-based scorecards.

4.2 Number of residents

For the period 2019-2023 274 residents were admitted to all educational programs, including plans to admit residents to the program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children”. The total graduation of residents on the dates of the start of admission to residency in all specialties was 39 people, including no graduation from the accredited educational program.

CF “UMC” analysed the need in practical healthcare for ophthalmologists and concluded that the annual admission to the educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults and children” will be 5 people. This indicator corresponds to resource capabilities. Sources of information about the needs for ophthalmology specialists are compiled on the basis of requests for applications for a list of specialties, according to the state order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

4.3 Support and counselling for residents

The practice of academic advising, personal support for residents and the development of not only professional skills were assessed by experts through a 360-degree survey. When conducting interviews with residents and graduates, the following information was obtained: almost all respondents had the opportunity to master the necessary practical skills, as well as improve them. The opportunity to participate in UMC research work was noted; residents positively assessed the effectiveness of assessment forms, had access to literature in the library, computer programs, and positively assessed the support of the staff of the residency department.

The educational organization has a program for the development of residents, which includes the development of the intellectual level of students to expand knowledge; residents take part in master classes, republican and international conferences held by CF "UMC". Residents are included in such advisory bodies as councils, committees, working groups, etc., resident doctors participated in the discussion of the mission of the CF “UMC” and the educational program, access to which is available on the CF “UMC” website.

For example, for the purpose of social support for residents, the allocation of financial resources and support for obtaining research and educational grants have been organized in accordance with the interests of resident doctors. Financial support for residents is provided through the issuance of a scholarship in the amount of 100,036 tenge and additional financial support for residents, enshrined in the document “Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF “UMC”, approved by the Board of the CF “UMC” on 03/01/2018 No. 6.” Psychological support for residents is provided by the fact that the CF “UMC” has a psychosocial support sector, which, if necessary, provides confidential psychological assistance, and there is a room for psycho-emotional relief.

To plan the career of residency graduates, annual consultations are held by the Department of Education with final year resident doctors on employment issues. The employment rate of graduates of all residency programs was 100% in 2022.

4.4 Representation of residents

The following advisory and advisory bodies function in the educational organization: regular meetings of journal clubs, Ground Round, topics for discussion, which are provided by the resident doctors themselves, based on issues of interest to them in the departments, centres of the CF "UMC", 360 degree assessment. Some resident doctors are included in the UMC CF "UMC". When holding various meetings related to the educational process, resident doctors express their opinions, which are taken into account in the Department of Education (Minutes of the Department of Education No. 6 dated July 20, 2018), in which residents of all courses take part. Mechanisms for rewarding residents for community service include the opinion of resident doctors in the practice of the educational process. When interviewing residents, experts found that there is a schedule for the appointment of resident doctors by the Director of the Department of Education and Science A.A. Syzdykova.

4.5 Working conditions

Residents receive a monthly stipend in accordance with the document Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC" 03/01/2018 No. 6. Residents are given the opportunity to work during extracurricular hours, which is reflected in the document - Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC" 03/01/2018 No. 6. There are currently 23% of such residents.

In total, CF “UMC” has 2 of its own clinical bases for training residents, and each hosts various events in which residents participate. For example, department rounds, morning medical conferences, provision of assistance in departments according to specialty, duty as part of a team; consultations, conversations with patients and their relatives, in clinical reviews of complex cases; participate in organizing and holding conferences, symposiums, and forums; in carrying out research projects, make reports in the journal club. As a rule, residents supervise 5 patients per day, and 100 people per month. Residents make topical presentations such as “The use of Tezessa drugs in the treatment of endocrine ophthalmopathy.” Participate in sanitary educational work, including holding lectures, preparing sanitary bulletins, etc. Educational organizations have introduced elements of distance learning for residents, for example, online learning, electronic professional platforms (Zoom, etc.).

In special circumstances (for example, for a resident doctor transferred from another university, reinstated, remaining for a second year of study, returning from academic leave), an individual resident training program is applied, which is compiled on the basis of the WC approved for the corresponding academic year, as well as the catalogue elective disciplines, taking into account the difference in the academic program or academic debt. This is enshrined in the document - Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC" 03/01/2018 No. 6. Experts have found that in this case the duration of training is observed and is 2 years.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): completely -20.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To provide a mechanism for rewarding resident doctors for social work.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

The total number of employees is 116. The requirements for teachers of the residency program take into account special pedagogical or professional education, an academic degree, work experience of at least 5 years, and the highest/first qualification category.

35.3% of employees have an academic degree, 75 people (64.6%) have the highest category, 4 (35%) have the first category, 2 (1.7%) have the second. Training of residents in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults and children” can be carried out by 11 employees on the basis of the department of eye diseases, day hospital of the RDC.

The experts familiarized themselves with the job descriptions of teachers. Chapter 3 of the Rules “Coordination of work on the implementation of the residency program” specifies the responsibilities of the clinical mentor, the teacher of the residency program and the regulations on mentors.

The experts are familiar with the personnel policy of the CF “UMC”, the Regulations on mentors and teachers. The faculty to resident ratio is 3:1.

The motivation system for teachers and clinical mentors includes the following: conducting a 360-degree analysis, which is carried out by category: medical knowledge; professionalism; training of resident doctors. Holding awards in the nominations “Best Teacher”, “Best Curator”.

The principles of ethics and academic integrity of teachers are reflected in the document - Code of Business Ethics of the CF “UMC” No. 17 12/26/2022. When talking with teachers, they confirmed their awareness of this issue: 86% of teachers of specialized disciplines were rated 9-10 points, 10.3% - 7-8 points, 3.4% - 5-6 points.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the creation of a Recruitment Policy that ensures maximum efficiency in the search, selection, and hiring of employees, as well as an effective human resource management system that provides opportunities for maximizing the potential of employees. Conversation with Apukhtina U.A. master's degree, clinical fellow at the Department of Ophthalmology of the RDC included questions such as what is a prerequisite for the work of teachers? How candidates are selected and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting staff from

clinical sites for teaching (there are 11 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, the information security of the educational program, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since Most part-time students do not know teaching methods.

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (96.8%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 3.1% were partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 87.5% completely agree, 12.5% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR (personnel) service - 81.2% completely agree, 15.6% partially agree. Satisfied with wages - 40.6% completely agree, 12.5% partially agree.

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring, which includes lectures and practical classes; joint management of patients, participation in consultations, conferences, discussion of a clinical case, preparation for a journal club.

Experts determined that faculty and residents have adequate time for teaching, mentoring, and learning. Clinical preceptor work is determined at the rate of 3 hours per week per resident physician; and no more than 3 resident doctors at a time. Working time is 8 hours. Teachers conduct seminars lasting 2 hours. Time for clinical reviews, clinical rounds – 2 hours. Duty is 8 hours.

Experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is held annually: 21 employees of the CF "UMC" improved their qualifications under the "Mentoring Program in Research and Nursing", teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program were trained in 2021, including teachers of an accredited educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" - 3 people. These events are financed by the educational organization. The expert verified teacher certificates on topics such as "Methodology for developing examination materials for students and graduates of the Foundation (2020)."

Financing of mentors is carried out in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC" No. 6 03/29/2021.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation

In an educational organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 81.2% of surveyed teachers responded, and 18.75% partially agreed with this. They studied in professional development programs - 43.75% less than 1 year ago, 34.38% within a given year, 15.6% more than 5 years ago and 3.1% answered "I don't remember when it was."

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 40.6% answered that "yes, such programs exist," 6.25% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 34.38% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard improvement): fully – 8.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Logistics and equipment

Resident training is carried out on the basis of the CF "UMC"; RDC; JSC "National Centre for Neurosurgery", NJSC "National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Centre"; Multidisciplinary City Hospital 2, Astana; "Hospital of the Medical centre of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan", Multidisciplinary City Hospital 3 Astana, Multidisciplinary City Children's Hospital 3 Astana", including residents of an accredited educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" on the basis of the Republican Diagnostic centre (ophthalmological department, day hospital). There are 30 beds in total. There are 3 auditoriums, 2 conference rooms for seminars and

journal clubs, laboratories, a library with 200 and 50 seats, a computer class with 30 seats, a test centre with 34 seats.

The experts visited the library, which provides residents and employees with access to scientific literature, reference books, and fiction. The total literature on the accredited specialty on paper is 59 pieces, on electronic media - 32 pieces. The main monographs on the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" are the following: Atlas of Clinical Ophthalmology D.J. Spalton, R.A. Hitchings, P.A. Hunter and they are available in the library.

There is access to international databases: Thomson Reuters; Scopus; Thomson Reuters (Web of Science), Springer Link, Oxford Journals, Medline. Residents are aware of this.

Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his training.

Updating of the material and technical base, including the library background, is carried out every 5 years. So, over 5 years, the update affected the following: textbooks, monographs by domestic and foreign authors.

6.2 Clinical sites

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of the Republican Diagnostic centre with a total outpatient appointment of 800 were visited, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff and the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients are provided (for example, patients with age-related cataracts, glaucoma, and age-related macular degeneration), modern equipment, which demonstrates accessibility to students, teachers provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology.

During visits to clinical sites (Republican Diagnostic Centre, National Centre for Motherhood and Childhood), experts examined resources, their compliance with the training program, accessibility for teachers and residents.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for supervising patients, working with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs," and the availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and conducting international events.

There is a simulation centre equipped with equipment, including: a headform for mastering ophthalmoscopy. Residents of the educational program in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" can practice practical skills: direct and indirect ophthalmoscopy. Providing emergency care to patients with acute vascular conditions is also included in the training program.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment in organizing training, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research work, financing, demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from a foreign expert Ziganshina Liliya Yevgenievna. Experts examined residents' documents (portfolios, resident assessment results: checklists, resident survey results).

6.3 Information technology

Experts assessed residents' and faculty's access to necessary web resources, including Thomson Reuters, Scopus, Oxford Journals, as well as access to electronic media (Pubmed, Up to date, Medline Complete, Clinical Key, Cochrane Library). Residents confirmed that they can use the scientific library of the Nazarbayev University School of Medicine, which provides information resources in English, Russian, and Kazakh languages, including when preparing for classes.

Information and communication technologies are represented by the following: Thomson Reuters; Scopus; Thomson Reuters (Web of Science), Springer Link, Oxford Journals, Medline. The educational program uses technologies such as interactive methods of theoretical teaching, practical training through scientific research, simulation technologies, clinical training (practical skills). During independent training, residents apply simulation training methods, patient management, clinical rounds, and participation in surgical interventions together with a mentor. Access to patient data and the healthcare information system is provided through Microsoft Outlook - corporate e-mail of the CF "UMC", Bitrix-24 - corporate portal of the CF "UMC". The resident supervises 5 patients per day, including completing the necessary documentation under the supervision of a teacher.

Elements of distance learning methods, such as electronic professional platforms (Zoom), access to Moodle outside the workplace, are used when training residents after forced breaks, long-term illness, or military service. At the same time, the ethics documented in the Rules for organizing the educational program in the residency of the CF "UMC" are observed.

6.4 Clinical teams

In order to develop the experience of working in a team among residents, the educational organization holds events such as journal club meetings. Experts attended a journal club meeting. Inter-professional interaction is also carried out through the Educational and Clinical Commission of the CF "UMC" Ground Round. Residents can conduct health education activities among patients and educational activities among interns. For example, ophthalmology residents prepared a health bulletin "Glaucoma, what do you need to know?"

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 90% of teachers completely agree with this, 8% partially agree, 2% found it difficult to answer.

6.5 Medical research and advances

The educational organization carries out research work in such areas as oncology, transplantation, radiology. Over 5 years, progress has been achieved. In July 2018, the results of 23 research works of residency graduates were presented in the form of a presentation at the EMC meeting. Residents of 2-3 years of study are involved in carrying out scientific work (or fragments). They perform such types of work as collecting literary data, processing medical histories, and outpatient records. All information about scientific work is included in the resident's portfolio, the structure of which is based on the Regulations on the organization of research work.

The educational program includes topics where residents study research methods in medicine (evidence-based medicine methods). In this case, the total hours are 15 hours.

If residents carry out scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment.

For example, in the specialty of Paediatrics, it is planned to conduct research work on the following topics: "Childhood celiac disease in Kazakhstan: epidemiological analysis and implementation of screening and diagnostic strategies. PL - Poddighe D. (2020-2022)." This information was obtained during an interview with teacher Tuleutaev Ye.T. There are no studies planned in ophthalmology yet.

Interviews with 16 teachers, including 10 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of case patients, time to maintain medical records, independent work).

6.6 Educational expertise

Expertise in education includes the following areas: quality management system, joint meetings with resident doctors of all years of study, a mechanism for evaluating the educational program, which are designed in the form of research, including credit-credit and modular training systems.

The educational organization is involved in such educational projects as competency-based learning models. As a result of the implementation of these projects, a comprehensive 360-degree survey was introduced.

Employees of the Education Department conduct annual monitoring of the quality of educational programs.

Sociological surveys, including questions of the quality of education, could become one of the mechanisms for examining education. However, in the organization of education, the established educational and methodological council of the CF “UMC” prefers the use of 360-degree surveys.

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. For example, it is the need to introduce a credit-based and modular training system.

Mechanisms for motivating and developing the interest of employees and teachers in conducting research in the field of postgraduate education are the regulation of remuneration for employees involved in educational, scientific, and innovative activities; involvement in various projects. This is documented in the Rules for planning, organizing and implementing scientific research 04/04/2022 No. 4.

Clinical learning resources are updated annually and in 2023. The residency program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” is provided with the following: equipment necessary for the diagnosis and treatment of patients: slit lamps, tonometers, refractometers, perimeters, ultrasound equipment, optical coherence tomography, laser unit.

6.7 Training in other institutions

The academic policy for resident training includes the possibility of training at alternative organizations if existing clinical sites do not cover all topics of the educational program. At the same time, training of residents in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults and children” is carried out on the basis of the Republican Diagnostic Centre, where there are departments: ophthalmology department, day hospital, with a total bed capacity of 800. Such disciplines of the educational program as outpatient ophthalmology - 1,2; ophthalmology in the hospital - 1,2,3, microsurgery, residents study in the ophthalmology department, in the day hospital. The preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the guidance of a teacher and does not require additional training bases.

Residents can participate in academic mobility within the country, since there is no opportunity for foreign mobility yet.

There is a document on the transfer and offset of learning results between educational organizations: Regulations on the procedure for transferring loans in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education”, Rules for organizing the educational process in credit technology of education (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152).

6 agreements and 7 memoranda were concluded with organizations, universities, associations, including clinics in Turkey, Israel, Italy, etc. Such cooperation makes it possible to introduce the following teaching methods and technologies into residency programs: credit-based, competency-based, problem-based learning, and simulation. For example, in the specialty of an accredited educational program, international cooperation is carried out with the USA, Russia, Finland, and Korea.

Teachers of educational organizations actively participate in republican and international events. Thus, 22 teachers took part in the educational program “Professional Development Program (PDP) in the field of scientific research.” Such participation allows you to apply the information received in the educational process. For example, in the specialty of the educational program “Ophthalmology for adults and children”, scientific and practical activities such as the research project “Demyelinating Disease” are carried out. Over a period of 5 years, 50 teachers were trained abroad in clinical specialties and in methods of medical education.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully – 18

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring of the educational program includes a system of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program carried out at all levels and includes a system of evaluation forms “360 Degree Analysis”, which ensures transparency of the process and results. An annual analysis of the educational program will allow the educational organization to make adjustments and improve the content. Subsequently, the residency program was approved at a meeting of the UMC (minutes No. 5, date 04/27/2023). Regular evaluation of the quality of the educational program is carried out by the Department of Education by monitoring the processes and results of learning using control and measurement tools (test tasks, situational tasks, tickets for current and knowledge control).

When evaluating the program, the goals and objectives of training and the final learning outcomes are taken into account (through assessment of residents, independent examination). The process of implementing the educational program is assessed through feedback from residents and teachers and the achievements of graduates. For example, a 2019 survey of residents in the specialties of paediatrics and neurology demonstrated the following: 91.9% positively assess the number of patients in the departments, 81.6% note sufficient responsibility of resident doctors in making decisions in the management of patients; 79% rate doctors' support positively; 81% of resident doctors are considering the possibility of participating in scientific research at the CF “UMC”. A survey of faculty conducted in 2019 showed that 28.6% of respondents find enough time for effective teaching; residents; 57.2% of residents are independent, 42.8% need supervision from a teacher and counselling.

The assessment of approaches to the admission of residents is carried out using the “360 degree analysis” methodology.

The selection and compliance of teachers and teaching methods is also carried out through feedback from residents. For example, the results of a survey of residents in 2022 and 2023 showed that teachers out of 29 teachers were rated at “9-10” points by 86.3%, “7-8” points by 10.3%, “5-6” points – 3.4%.

Evaluation of methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of residents is carried out using control and measurement tools (test tasks, situational tasks, tickets, questions, etc.) and demonstrates a high level of theoretical knowledge and practical skills.

The evaluation of the sufficiency and quality of educational resources is based on the “360 degree Analysis” methodology and shows that the main criteria for evaluating the residency program are rated by residents with a high rating of 8.1 points out of 10.

In the process of assessing the quality of residency educational programs, it was found that, along with achievements (79.5% of respondents positively evaluate the work of the Journal Club, 72.2% - lectures, 55.9% - the effectiveness of using formative and summative evaluation in increasing the level of clinical knowledge) there is a number of problems and shortcomings, including only 28.6% of teachers find enough time to effectively train residents.

7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents

Educational organizations regularly collect feedback from teachers, residents, and employers. Every year, CF “UMC” sends questionnaires to employers.

To survey teachers, a questionnaire was developed that included 15 questions, including questions divided into 3 levels assessed on a ten-point scale: general assessment criteria - 7, level of effectiveness and informativeness of new educational activities - 6.3, provision of residents with various resources for training - 7, 7. Results of a survey of teachers conducted in 2022 and 2023 showed that the teachers participating in the survey clearly understand the purpose and objectives of the residency program, only 57.2% of residents are independent, and 42.8% need supervision when communicating with patients and consulting.

The survey of residents is conducted once a year and is devoted to such topics as the volume and quality of knowledge acquired, methods and forms of teaching, the level of theoretical and practical application of the knowledge gained. The survey is conducted anonymously on the online platform Qualtrics.com.

As a result of analysing the results of a survey of teachers and residents, the following changes occurred: 65.7% of teachers positively assess the effectiveness of new educational activities, 77.3% believe that the introduced assessment forms contribute to the improvement of clinical knowledge and skills. 57.7% of residents positively assess the effectiveness of using methods for monitoring the improvement of practical skills.

7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes

The results of residents and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programs. The final results of the assessment of residents in various specialties in 2022 show the following: 67.52% of graduates received a “good” rating, 87.5% received an “excellent” rating.

Thus, the results of an independent assessment of residents in 2022 showed that in 2019-2022, 100% of graduates received “good” and “excellent”, and in 2023 was 80%.

Faculty assessed the level of clinical training of residents in 2021 and 2022 in the following competencies: patient supervision, communication and collaboration, safety and quality. Experts noted the following successes in the clinical training of residents: they are able to effectively provide medical care to the population, make decisions based on evidence-based medicine, and use modern diagnostic and treatment technologies. At the same time, experts also identified shortcomings in the clinical training of residents, which include the basics of diagnosis and emergency care in emergency conditions.

Monitoring of residency program graduates is carried out through employer surveys. Residents of 2021-2022 graduation (159 people in total) were employed 100% in medical organizations, including 19 people who remained at CF”UMC”. Employers appreciated such qualities of graduates as communication, collaboration, and public health. However, the weaknesses of the graduates were also noted: safety and quality. The employment rate over 5 years ranged from 80% to 100%.

Since the entire process of training and monitoring of residents is concentrated in the Department of Education and Science, the results of assessing the clinical practice of residents and graduates are immediately sent to the responsible persons. The department of science and education, sectors of science and education centres are responsible for residency programs. To improve the educational process, the following has been done in the last 2-3 years: monitoring the implementation of innovative educational technologies and promising forms of organizing the educational process.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

Educational organizations have approaches to involving teachers and residents in evaluating the educational program and monitoring its implementation. Thus, residents are included in the advisory body “Educational and Methodological Council” and participate in the discussion of all issues of the educational process. The results of the evaluation of the educational program are announced at a meeting of the educational and methodological council.

Interviews with representatives of medical institutions of the republican and regional level and employers were conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university’s mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs

The educational organization has established a system for documenting the educational process, including approval of the educational program, which includes the following: evaluation of programs at the planning stages.

The educational program is approved by the Educational and Methodological Council (EMC) on the basis of such criteria as standard curricula, working curricula, individual curricula, and a catalogue of elective disciplines. The interested parties involved in the approval of the educational program are

the National Centre for Independent Examination, medical institutions of regional health departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and representatives of the doctors' association.

A system for monitoring the quality and compliance of clinical sites, material and technical equipment and educational resources has been developed and implemented, which includes the following: a quality management department, which provides methodological assistance in the selection of indicators throughout the centre and at the department level, coordination of measures to change the indicator, implementation of the system incident reports, safety culture indicators, coordination of data collection and transmission to the relevant commissions.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully – 10.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

Residency training is carried out in accordance with the requirements of such regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents, such as the rules for admission to residency of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" protocol No. 5 of March 1, 2018. Assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out on the basis of a final certification. To implement the educational program, the educational organization has an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented by the departments of science and education. The experts reviewed the documents confirming the completion of resident training, including the certificate of completion of residency. The certificate of completion of residency is issued to residents who have passed state certification in the specialty "Ophthalmology for adults, children" and contains information about the qualification "Ophthalmologist for adults, children."

The quality assurance program for postgraduate education was developed by the Department of Education and approved by the educational and methodological council. A.A. Syzdykovna took part in the development of the program.

All medical workers are aware of the program through the official website of the CF "UMC".

8.2 Academic leadership

The responsibilities and duties of the management and staff for postgraduate medical education are determined, which are assigned to N.K. Khamzina, who is the curator for residency issues and enshrined in the document "Order No. 04-n\k dated 02/07/2023 "On the distribution of responsibilities, areas of authority and responsibility between members of the Board and other officials of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre". The clinical and academic departments and the Department of Education are responsible for the direct management of residency programs and coordination of the activities of resident physicians. Transparency of management and decision-making in the educational process is ensured through discussion at the Educational and Methodological Council, posting information on the website of the CF "UMC", which is reflected in the document "Order of the Deputy Chairman of the Board No. 9 dated June 14, 2023."

The educational organization evaluates the management of the educational process and employees in relation to the achievement of the mission of the residency program, the expected final results of training by conducting feedback with residents and teachers (see section 7.2 of the report), conducting certification based on the "360 degree survey" document, audits on issues of evaluation of residency programs of the CF "UMC".

To the question of the questionnaire "Do the heads of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work," 79% of teachers answered that systematically, 13% answered "sometimes", 8% "rather rarely", 0% "never".

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The department responsible for planning and distribution of finances in residency programs is the financial and economic department under the leadership of the managing director for finance. The range of duties, responsibilities and powers are reflected in the job descriptions "On the distribution of

duties, areas of authority and responsibility between members of the Board and other officials of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”, approved by Order No. 04-n/k dated 02/07/2023.

A financial plan is drawn up annually, including a target budget for training, which is 108,155,649 tenge for 2022, 109,963,106.36 for 1-3 quarters of 2023. The financial plan is in line with the strategic plan for the period 2019-2023. The share of funding for residency programs, taking into account the expansion of residency specialties, increased from 6.5% in 2021 to 10% in 2023. Most funds are spent on the purchase of educational and scientific literature, Internet access to international literature information databases. In 2017-2018, more than 120 titles of books were purchased, simulation equipment was purchased, and resident doctors were sent to internships and conferences. During a meeting with financial sector employees, experts found out that the amount of financial resources allocated for the educational program is sufficient.

A financial report is submitted annually, which is approved by financial activities, periodically reviewed at a meeting of the budget and tariff commission and demonstrates, among other things, the distribution of educational resources in accordance with needs and the covering of all types of expenses (teacher salaries, stipends for resident doctors, necessary literature, resources of the Internet, information and communication technologies, inviting foreign teachers, internships abroad, participation in conferences, seminars) for the implementation and development of the residency program.

8.4 Administration and management

There is an appropriate administrative (According to the organizational structure of CF “UMC”, the administrative and managerial staff consists of 317 people) and academic (206 people) staff, including management: Director of the Department of Education - Syzdykova A.A. To effectively manage the educational process, employees of the Education Department have undergone advanced training in strategic management.

Experts found that the QMS is not certified, but elements of a quality management system have been introduced into the educational process.

Evaluation of the administration and management of the educational process in general and the educational residency program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults and children” is carried out through the implementation of clinical protocols, SOPs and the results demonstrate such achievements as improving the quality of examination of medical records.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The educational organization complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with the classifier of residency specialties (On approval of the Classifier of areas of training for personnel with higher and postgraduate education; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569), training is being carried out in educational organizations at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year in 20 specialties. All educational programs are provided with relevant educational and methodological documents and teachers.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully – 11.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The procedure for updating the organizational structure is carried out in accordance with changes to the State Compulsory Educational Standards of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; internal regulatory documents were revised to bring them into line with the new established requirements, and in 2023 changes were made such as the use of distance technologies in the educational process; the professional ZOOM platform was purchased.

The resident training process has undergone such updates as many educational events have been transferred to a distance format: journal club, lectures, project defences, consultations, meetings on educational and methodological issues, etc.

Updates are made by revising curricula, syllabuses and are accompanied by the development of new assessment programs.

The educational organization annually allocates resources for continuous improvement.

To purposefully improve the educational process, sociological research is carried out, including the main tool for assessing the quality and monitoring the educational process is “360 degree analysis”, which allows for evaluation by residents, teachers, doctors, curators, patients, and literature on postgraduate medical education is also studied. In the process of this analysis, approaches to teaching in residency were revised, and methods such as distance learning, journal club, simulation class, and Grand round were introduced.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 Standard improvement): completely – 2.

CONCLUSION:

When conducting an external evaluation of the educational program, it was found that out of 114 standards (including basic standards - 82 and improvement standards - 32), 112 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational program “Ophthalmology for adults, children”:

Standard 2.

- 1) To include in the educational program such topics as neoplasms of the organ of vision, vascular diseases of the orbit, parasitic pathologies of the orbit.

Standard 3

- 2) When compiling tests, take into account the ratio of levels: memorization 10%, understanding 45%, application 45%.
- 3) To translate evaluation forms to electronic media

Standard 4.

- 4) To provide a mechanism for rewarding resident doctors for social work.

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in the specialty “Ophthalmology for adults, children” with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Signature
Chairman of the EEC	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	
Foreign expert	Ziganshina Liliya Yevgenevna	
Foreign expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	
Academic expert	Zhanteliyeva Lyazzat Asanovna	
Academic expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	
Academic expert	Idrisov Alisher Saugabaevich	
Academic expert	Ramazanov Sholpan Khamzaevna	
Academic expert	Dolmatova Irina Anatolyevna	
Academic expert	Arinova Saule Pasevnoevna	
Academic expert	Karibaeva Dina Orynbasarovna	
Academic expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	
Academic expert	Menchisheva Yulia Alexandrovna	
Resident expert	Yerkinov Yerbolat	
Resident expert	Orynbay Aizere Sauletkyzy	

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of an educational program (summarization)

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS/SI*	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Does not compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	14	9/5	14		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	22	19/3	21	1	
3.	ASSESSMENT	9	6/3	8	1	
4.	RESIDENTS	20	14/6	20		
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY	8	7/1	8		
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	18	11/7	18		
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	10	7/3	10		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	11	8/3	11		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	2	1/1	2		
		114	82/32	112	2	
				114		

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭЖ в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры

№	Наименования документов	Количество
1.	Образовательная программа	1
2.	Силлабусы	9
3.	Рабочий учебный план	1
4.	Расписание	1
5.	Должностные инструкции	2
6.	Лист привилегий по программе резидентуры «Офтальмология взрослая, детская»	5
7.	Правила организации образовательного процесса в резидентуре КФ «УМС»	1
8.	Инструкция по разработке учебно-методической документации и системе оценки учебных достижений врачей-резидентов КФ «УМС»	1
9.	Положение о научной и инновационной деятельности КФ «УМС» от 22.02.2018 №4	
10.	Перечень учебных рабочих планов.	
11.	Правила приема в резидентуру КФ «УМС» 01.03.2018 №5.	